

Review proforma for open reviews on the COPPHA repository

This proforma has been developed for the [Coalition for Open Publishing of Public Health in Africa](#) (COPPHA). You can use this proforma to review each part of a scientific journal article. You might want to explore more detailed ways of reviewing a paper by accessing this free online course [Critical Appraisal](#).

* Indicates required question. Note: the text boxes will expand automatically to allow detailed responses

1. What is the title of the manuscript you are reviewing? *

2. Please specify if you have, or think you might have, any bias or conflict of interest in reviewing this manuscript? *

3. Please give a brief description of the topic, objective and main findings of the study. Briefly highlight the strength(s) of the study*

4. Does the abstract provide a concise summary of the study, including introduction, methods, results, and conclusions? *

Mark only one

- ☐ Yes
☐ No
☐ Partially

If you have any concerns about the Abstract, or would like to make any comments, please list them here.

5. Do you have any concerns about the Introduction or Background to the study? These might include concerns about the literature review or whether a research question or hypothesis has been adequately stated. *

Mark only one

- ☐ Major concerns
- ☐ Minor concerns
- ☐ No concerns

If you have any concerns about the Background or Introduction, or would like to make any comments, please list them here.

6. Do you have any concerns about the Methods section of the paper? These might include concerns about selection, measurement or confounding biases or the statistical analyses. *

Mark only one

- ☐ Major concerns
- ☐ Minor concerns
- ☐ No concerns

If you have any concerns about the Methods section, or would like to make any comments, please list them here.

7. Do you have any concerns about the Results section of the paper? These might include concerns about selection, measurement or confounding biases or the statistical analyses - or if each table, figure or graph is fully understandable as a stand alone. Are the results reported against the research question stated initially. *

Mark only one

- ☐ Major concerns
- ☐ Minor concerns
- ☐ No concerns

If you have any concerns about the Results section, or would like to make any comments, please list them here.

8. Do you have any concerns about the Discussion or Conclusions section of the paper? These might include ethical concerns, usefulness or generalisability of the findings and if the study limitations have been adequately identified. *

Mark only one

- ☐ Major concerns
- ☐ Minor concerns
- ☐ No concerns

If you have any concerns about the Discussion or Conclusions sections, or would like to make any comments, please list them here.

9. Transparency and Reproducibility: Is the research process transparent, and are data or code available for others to reproduce your findings?*

Mark only one

- ☐ Yes
- ☐ No
- ☐ Partial
- ☐ Not relevant

10. Language: Do you have any concerns about the writing style or use of language?

Mark only one

- ☐ Yes
- ☐ No

11. What is your recommendation?*

Mark only one

- ☐ Approve without revision
- ☐ Approve, require minor revision
- ☐ Approve, require major revision
- ☐ Reject

12. Final comments: please add any final comments that you think would be helpful to the authors. If you have recommended Approve with revisions, or Reject, please give your reasons. *